

I hereby endorse
Rector/Director _____
“ ” _____ 2017

PhD PROGRAM SELF-ASSESSMENT

_____ YEREVAN STATE ACADEMY OF FINE ARTS _____
(Name of the Institution)

___ART HISTORY AND THEORY, FINE ARTS, DESIGN, APPLIED ARTS ___
(Name and code of the specialty)

_____ YEREVAN, ISAHAKYAN STR. 36 _____
(Address of the Institution)

Composition of the self-assessment working group

Name, Surname	Position	Responsibility in the group
Nazenie Garibian	Head of the Research Center	
Mkrtich Ayvazyan	Deputy-Rector	
Anahit Ohanyan	Scientific Secretary	
<i>Please insert rows, if necessary</i>		

CONTENT

1. Institutional strategies.....	4
2. Doctoral program.....	5

3. Admission Policy	9
4. Supervisor	10
5. Research Environment	11
6. Doctoral Candidates	12
7. Internationalization	13
8. PhD awarding.....	14
9. Internal quality assurance.....	14
SWOT analysis of the doctoral program	15

Note: each standard should be assessed separately (e.g. 1.1; 1.2; 1.3...)

1. Institutional strategies

The Higher Education Institution's (hereinafter HEI) research strategy is in concord with its mission and goals.

Please mention the research ambitions of the HEI and describe the formation of research strategy reflecting the ambitions of the HEI in research.

1.1 HEI has a research strategy that is adopted at the institutional level of the HEI, represents the institution's mission and its goals for research.

a. The research mission of University is to develop research in the field of arts contributing to the creation of new knowledge in these domains and promoting the national artistic thought and culture.

b. YSAFA strategic plan for 2017-2021 (see Doc. 1 **Strategic Plan**) developed and approved, where research is included as a separate goal (See Goal 3). Here the research strategy and directions are described in details. The research priorities are : Interaction between research and teaching, expansion of international relations, research internationalization, targeted and adapted definition of research themes/topics based on the mission and resources of University, current trends and needs in those fields, as well as demand for ensuring competitiveness. They fully correspond to University's vision, research goals and mission. The design and continuous improvement of PhD program is also stated in the mission of University.

Hereby

c. Research Center for Arts and Humanities (hereafter Center) is established, which claims to be interdisciplinary.

d. Center develops, focuses and coordinates the research activities of University, as well as post-graduate program and curriculum. The activities of Center are based on YSAFA strategic goals, as well as on requirements set by TEMPUS VERITAS program.

1.2 Research strategy reflects the needs of the internal and external stakeholders and includes ethical concepts.

a. YSAFA Research Center developed a detailed and targeted strategic plan (See Doc. 2. **Research Center strategic plan, research directions and programs**), as well as defined the research directions of University for the next 5 years. They are based on YSAFA research mission and research strategy taking into consideration University's human and material resources, the current situation in art fields, existing issues and development trends of the art research on international level, as well as fields and themes that ensure competitiveness.

b. For the first time in Armenia, the Center formulated research directions, defined development trends and chose targeted themes for the fields of Fine Arts, Design and Applied Arts, which should assure implementation of University's research mission, as well as competitiveness on national and international levels.

c. Starting from this year YSAFA plans to allocate nominate percentage from the budget for the research development, implementation and coordination of research works.

1.3 HEI has formal mechanisms and procedures to evaluate the effectiveness of research strategy and to further improve it.

a. The activities of Center are planned on annual basis, quarterly and annual reports are implemented, which ensures the monitoring and assessment of the completed works (see doc. 3 and 4, **Annual Plan and Report of Center**).

b. Since the next year, Center will set the practice of the research work planning for the full and part-time academic staff, who shall present a research theme/topic for a defined period going from one up to three years. The themes/topics should be chosen within the framework of YSAFA research directions.

c. University publishes its own review: "Yearbook of the Academy of Fine Arts", where the research results of YSAFA academic staff and students are included.

d. University requires an annual report from the academic staff about their research works. The reports are analysed and mapped by the Center.

e. One of the assessment mechanisms at University can be the ongoing internal and external research grant projects.

2. Doctoral program

The doctoral program's ambitions are in concord with the institution's research strategy, forms part of institutional planning and resource allocation, is designed to meet new challenges and needs of global labour market.

Please analyze how the doctoral program intended learning outcomes are achieved (stressing student progress).

2.1 Doctoral program is thoroughly formulated, according to the intended outcomes, is flexible, meets the needs of doctoral candidates and is in line with the institution's research strategy.

a. The new PhD program for art research is developed in accordance with the pre-set learning outcomes. The framework of program goals and research topics is based on strategic goals and research directions of Center, which have been designed according to YSAFA research goals and mission.

b. The design and implementation of the program ensure two structures: Center and Scientific Unit. The design of the program is included in their annual work plan with the mention about the required resources.

c. The learning outcomes of the program are defined taking into account Researcher Qualification Framework (descriptors) proposed by National Qualification Framework (NQF), the Research Capacity Building Scale (RCBS) suggested by ANQA, University's strategic goals and research ambitions, Strategic plan and research directions designed by Center (See doc. 5. **NQF-program outcomes**). The PhD program's learning outcome alignment with the RQF and RCBS is shown on two systematized

tables.

d. The logical progress of the program and the curriculum are structured and distributed by years taking into consideration:

- the 3 main aspects of doctoral education, which are the student-centered teaching, the creation and interpretation of new knowledge through original research, as well as the use of innovative-experimental techniques and technologies in the field of arts.
- 3 components of learning quality assurance, which are: knowledge, competences and skills.
- Research Capacity Building Scale suggested by ANQA, which includes 6 stages each of them having 5 degrees.

e. The program name is “PhD Program for Research in Arts” (for the professions of Art History and Theory, Painting, Sculpture, Graphics, Design, Applied Arts).

f. The program is elaborated taking into account:

- Learning outcomes,
- Salzburg principles,
- Strategy for the research activities of University,
- Strategy, work plan and research directions designed by Center,
- Current issues in the art research, unrivaled fields or unstudied topics, the latter's validity and relevance both in the national and international context,
- Student-centered approach
- Ensuring of YSAFA competitiveness on international level.

g. The program is flexible as it consists of **Two separate parts**, which include more adapted and targeted requirements and are consistent with the professional qualifications given at University:

1- Art History and Theory, 2- Fine Arts, Design and Applied Arts.

h. The second part of the program, i.e. Fine Arts, Design and Applied Arts, is **completely new** in Armenia and for the first time will represent a contextual proposal for the PhD education by those professions, where new requirements for admission, research implementation and defence are included. Hence, the thesis for the artistic and performing professions will not be a research in art history, as it was done previously, but an artistic research project including a creative-artistic part and a written part, that is the dissertation. The research program and curriculum for Fine Arts, Design and Applied arts is elaborated in accordance with the international experience and current application of the art research, which is consistent with the challenges in the global labour market. It gives an opportunity to increase the competitiveness of art research conducted at University.

The artistic chairs of the university took part in the definition of research directions for their respective professions making compliance of program's goals with the academic resources of University more efficient. In case of successful implementation of Program it will greatly contribute to the improvement of art research and preparation of qualified specialists. It could also be an example for other art universities, as well as for the literary department.

i. The investment of the new program will give a chance to ensure PhD students mobility and to organize joint supervisions and joint programs.

2.2 Doctoral program is contextually coherent with other relevant doctoral programs.

There is no other doctoral program at our University.

2.3 Doctoral program is functioning in the context of a strong research environment ensuring critical mass of researchers and relevant resources promoting interdisciplinary approach.

a. The strategic plan designed by Center adopted an interdisciplinary approach according to which the framework of research directions and themes/topics has been modeled. Besides research topics relating various branches of art, the research between art and humanities is encouraged.

b. The curriculum of the program includes subjects and courses enabling the interdisciplinary research (see doc. **6, Curriculum**).

c. The Center makes efforts to:

- enhance the participation to grant projects assuring the student mobility and the critical mass of research,
- establish relations with local and foreign partners to implement joint programs and joint supervision,
- organize research activities including lectures, discussions, visiting seminars, meetings, cognitive travels presentations etc., also with participation of students.
- enhance the interchanges between University's PhD students: the latter make presentations about their thesis progress, research issues, which are discussed with supervisor, lecturers and students.
-

d. Center supports students for participating in national and international conferences.

e. The new program become aligned with vision and standards of European PhD education in the arts, which will give an opportunity to cooperate with art institutions and programs on international level.

2.4 Doctoral program provides training in core discipline areas and transferable skills and ensures an active involvement of doctoral candidates in research activities.

a. The curriculum of Program is elaborated based on the programs' LOs. Hence, systematized tables showing the relevance of outcomes and modules/courses, as well as qualification descriptors and modules/courses are compiled (see doc. **7, Curriculum-Outcomes**).

b. The curriculum is expected for 3 semesters (36 credits) and has 4 educational blocs each of which includes 3 courses. The optional courses are also planned. These blocs/sections are the followings.

- research knowledge and skills,
- linguistic and computing knowledge and skills,
- teaching and leadership,
- in-depth professional knowledge and skills.
-

c. The logical progress of courses included in the modules are relevant with the 3 components of quality assurance and the logical process of research capacity building scale.

2.5 Doctoral program has set criteria on the assessment of the quality of research results against achieved outcomes and mechanisms for the evaluation of the research results' social impact.

a. Systematized tables are set showing PhD program learning outcomes alignment with NQF 8 level LOs and Research Capacity Building Scale (See doc. **5. NQF-program outcomes**)

b. Systematized tables are set showing the alignment of learning outcomes with modules/courses of the curriculum as well as that of qualification descriptors with modules/courses (See doc. **7, Curriculum-Outcomes**)

c. After admission the student should conduct learning needs analysis, which enables her/him to reflect on existing competences and identify areas in need of development. As a result, a student will manage to clarify the scope of his/her theme, qualitative requirements and topic.

d. It is required that the main supervisor and the PhD student have meetings on the regular basis, soon after the *Agreement* is signed and until the completion of the thesis. The meetings are duly recorded in the eventual meeting lists (See doc. **8, Meeting sheet**)

e. The qualitative results of the research are assessed through yearly attestation, during of which the student presents a report about his/her work. The report should be compared with the program outcomes, as well as with the 3 components of quality assurance of learning and the logical process of Research capacity building scale.

f. The new program plans an annual report from the supervisor as well, attached with his/her assessment/opinion of the student work progress.

g. The *Meetings sheets* are also presented to the annual attestation committee.

h. Learning outcomes are assessed through exams, the exam bulletins should be attached to reports presented to the annual attestation session.

i. For the second part of the program (Fine Arts, Design and Applied Arts) as a quality assessing standard, besides publications, exhibitions or other art events are also included.

j. In cooperation with Career Center of YSAFA, it is planned to frame the career and scientific and social progress of the young doctors after the thesis defence.

2.6 There are set mechanisms and procedures in place to ensure development, approval, monitoring and periodic review of doctoral program with an active involvement of internal and external stakeholders.

Those mechanisms have not been yet designed as the development of the new program has not been fulfilled and the pilot-program has not been invested at University.

3. Admission Policy

HEI's admission policy on doctoral program is transparent, is in line with doctoral program's ambitions.

Please analyze whether the selection mechanisms of doctoral candidates are aligned with the doctoral program's ambition.

3.1 HEI has set mechanisms for promoting equitable recruitment, selection and admission procedures.

a. A new procedure for admission is designed by the new program. It reflects the program's goals, is targeted and gives an opportunity to assure the transparency of the procedure and more efficient selection of applicants.

b. For admission, applicants should present a research proposal, which is unprecedented in Armenia. Having decided the topic and having a research proposal before admission will give a chance to have a proper and targeted approach to the selection of applicants, as well as to win time using it to start the research.

c. The new procedure has different principles and requirements to the applicants of Art History and Theory and to those of artistic-performing professions.

d. The new procedure for the admission to Art History and Theory includes:

- research proposal, which includes: the research topic, objectives, its actuality and originality, methods and means for conducting the research, general bibliography on the topic.
- recommendation letter from a recognised specialist of the field (the recommendation should be sent to the scientific secretary by e-mail).
- motivation letter,
- at least one publication (at least 6 pages),
- the grade of the Master thesis defence and the assessment of the reviewer.
- the applicant should be interviewed, where he/she should demonstrate general knowledge on art history and specific knowledge on his topic, ability to formulate thoughts orally, perception for implementing research in the field of art.
-

e. The new procedure for admission to artistic-performing professions includes:

- proposal of an art research project, which will include the main topic and concept, its artistic-historical context and reasoning, solutions for its realization, its compositional, stylistic and technical-technological expressions,
- portfolio on recent works, if it is possible, information on exhibitions, pictures,
- recent diploma,
- recommendation from a well known specialist of the field,
- interview, where motivation and abilities for conducting a research will be checked, perceptions of the applicant on his/her research objectives.

f. The selection and admission is done by a small committee (3 persons), where Director of Research Center and if possible invited scholar should be included. For applicants of Fine Arts, Design and Applied Arts, one of the committee members should be an art professor.

3.2 Selection criteria of doctoral candidates are transparent, publicly available and are in line with the explicit outcomes of doctoral program.

a. To assure transparency of admission the committee members should compile a one-page bulletin for each candidate, where assessing conclusions about the admission requirements will be set based on the defined standards (See doc. **9. Admission Bulletin; Requirements and Assessments Standards**).

b. The assessing conclusions are open and available if there is an application.

c. Center and Scientific Unit are willing to consult PhD applicants if needed.

3.3 HEI periodically analyses the effectiveness of applicants' assessment system.

The program has not been yet invested and such mechanism does not exist.

4. Supervisor

HEI provides highly qualified supervisors/well structured supervisory team to achieve doctoral program's ambitions.

Please analyze how the HEI assures sufficient supervision motivated for the implementation of doctoral program's ambition.

4.1 Supervisors/supervisory team responsibilities, qualifications, workload, recognition criteria are comprehensively stated and described and are in line with doctoral program's ambitions.

a. A regulated, transparent and monitored mechanism for supervisor's work, as well as for cooperation between supervisor and PhD student is set by the new program.

b. The new program includes a 3-party contract to be signed between the student, the University and the supervisor, where rights and responsibilities of each party are clearly stated (See doc. **10. Agreement**).

c. Two supervisors should be named for each student - a main and an assistant, the working responsibilities of which are clearly stated by the program. For the students in Fine Arts, Design and Applied Arts, one of the supervisors should be an art historian, the other an artist-professor. The first one is responsible for theoretical part and the final thesis paper, the second one is responsible for the realization of the artistic work.

d. In the new program, besides the annual report of PhD candidate, there will be a separate report of the supervisor for his/her accomplished work, as well as the supervisor's assessment/opinion on the student's work.

<p>4.2 HEI has supervisor/ supervisory team appointment procedures.</p> <p>a. University does not have an appropriate procedure, it is limited by the general requirements set by Supreme Certifying Committee of RA.</p> <p>b. University is open for inviting external supervisors.</p>
<p>4.3 HEI has motivation mechanisms for supervisors to be involved in active researching and be part of relevant scientific network.</p> <p>a. Starting from this year internal grant system is to be included at University for interdisciplinary research projects in art addressed to supervisors, professors and PhD candidates.</p> <p>b. Special amount of hours for the research is indicated in the general workload of the professors.</p>
<p>4.4 There is well-established system for periodic evaluation of supervision that foster to review existing policies and procedures for supervision and to reveal the professional needs of supervisors.</p> <p>a. Besides supervisors' annual report and <i>Meeting-sheets</i>, other mechanisms have not been yet designed in order to assess the work of supervisors' team and reconsider policy for supervision.</p>
<p>4.5 HEI fosters the development and professional progress of supervisors.</p> <p>a. It is planned to design and adapted Supervisor's guideline.</p> <p>b. It is planned to organize guest trainings for supervisors.</p> <p>c. It is planned to use the opportunities of international programs for external trainings of supervisors.</p>
<p>5. Research Environment <i>HEI promotes the quality research provisions by creating an environment conducive to research.</i> <i>Please analyze how the HEI ensures the proper implementation of the doctoral program.</i></p>
<p>5.1. There are necessary resources for the implementation of PhD program in accordance with its content, which effectively support the implementation of program's ambitions and create an environment conducive to research.</p> <p>a. Besides the Art history and Art chairs, as well as Scientific Unit, Research Center has been established to implement the PhD program.</p> <p>b. A research space is dedicated for the PhD students and supervisors work, meetings, discussions and other research activities, which is equipped with necessary electronic equipment.</p> <p>c. Library of Arts and Humanities of University has enough funds in order to conduct a research, including a unique archive funds of art after Flora Deznuni.</p> <p>d. Center organizes a digital library.</p>

<p>e. PhD students have an opportunity to publish their articles in YAFA Yearbook.</p>
<p>5.2 HEI monitors the scientific progress of the individual doctoral candidates by achieved scientific results and provides career development opportunities. Supervisors have primary responsibility in doctoral candidate's scientific progress.</p> <p>a. Center and Scientific Unit support PhD candidates by consulting, finding information, preparing and participating in the local and international conferences.</p> <p>b. Center supports PhD candidates for publishing in international journals and reviews, establishing relationship with international partners, participating in international research programs and in student exchange programs.</p> <p>c. Supervisors make annual report and assess doctoral candidate's progress and research work.</p>
<p>5.3 HEI ensures that all doctoral candidates receive useful and regular information and advice to promote research and to have opportunity to work in research teams and different research environments.</p> <p>a. Center and Scientific Unit are responsible for providing regular information and consultation to PhD candidates, as well as for assisting them to be included in various research programs.</p>
<p>5.4 HEI has sound financial distribution policy and capacity to sustain and ensure the integrity and continuity of doctoral programs at the institution.</p> <p>not yet applicable</p>
<p>5.5 HEI has mechanisms in place for the evaluation of the effectiveness, applicability and availability of resources.</p> <p>not yet applicable</p>
<p>6. Doctoral Candidates</p> <p><i>Doctoral candidates are recognized as professionals with commensurate rights.</i></p> <p><i>Please analyze whether the doctoral candidates are part of implementation of the HEI's ambitions in research.</i></p>
<p>6.1 HEI has formal mechanisms to regulate relations between candidate, supervisors and institution where the rights and responsibilities of doctoral candidates are clearly formulated.</p> <p>a. A regulated, transparent and monitored mechanisms for supervisor's work, as well as for cooperation between supervisor and doctoral candidate is set by the new program.</p> <p>b. The new program includes a-3-party Agreement to be signed between a student, university and supervisor, where rights and responsibilities of each party are clearly stated (See doc. 10. Agreement).</p> <p>c. The curriculum of the new program is designed in accordance with the needs and requirements of</p>

the PhD student who is considered to be a young researcher. The new program includes courses that are designed to develop the doctoral student's researching, teaching and leading/supervising skills.

d. Doctoral education guideline is planned to be published, where doctoral student's rights and responsibilities will be clearly defined, as well as student-supervisor relationship will be regulated.

6.2 Doctoral candidates are engaged in governance at the university and participate in decision-making.

a. University encourages PhD students by providing teaching possibilities more than the required minimum workload.

b. PhD students participate in Center's activities.

c. PhD students are included in different research programs of University.

6.3 HEI has set mechanisms that ensure quality of the student services and doctoral candidates are involved in the quality assurance practices.

Such mechanisms have not been yet set.

7. Internationalization

Internationalization is coherent with institution's research strategy and the individual needs of the doctoral candidates.

Please analyze how the HEI strives to be a part of local and international research networks by the implementation of the doctoral program.

7.1 HEI promotes fruitful and effective collaboration with local and international counterparts aiming to create critical mass and networking as well as to implement joint research and doctoral programs.

a. Stable and ongoing collaboration with local and international counterparts have not been yet established, but presently we are in contact with French Italian and Czeck universities on implementing programs and research projects.

b. University has resources to organize courses and seminars in English, French and Italian languages.

c. Program offers to publish the digital and print versions of thesis abstract in English, which Center will disseminate in relevant scientific environments and institutions.

7.2 The mobility of doctoral candidates is driven by the candidates' research projects.

University does not have doctoral candidates mobility yet.

7.3 HEI allocates sufficient financial resources for internationalization.

Internationalization has been included as a separate objective in YSAFA Strategic plan, however,

enough financial resources have not been yet provided for internationalization.

8. PhD awarding

HEI has clear mechanisms for monitoring and assessment of the research results (applicable to the institutions having Specialized Councils).

Please analyze how the Specialized Councils acknowledge the formation of an autonomous researcher.

Not applicable

8. PhD awarding

HEI has clear mechanisms for monitoring and assessment of the research results (applicable to the institutions having Specialized Councils).

Please analyze how the Specialized Councils acknowledge the formation of an autonomous researcher.

Not applicable

8.1 Specialized Council has PhD awarding criteria that are applied and periodically reviewed.

Not applicable.

8.2 HEI has set criteria for the nomination of the members of Specialized Council/s.

8.3 HEI periodically implements quality assurance of Specialized Council/s' activities.

8.4 Specialized Council/s periodically publishes reports on the development of the relevant fields.

9. Internal quality assurance

HEI has an internal quality assurance system, which promotes continual improvement of all the processes of doctoral education.

Please analyze how ther HEI promotes quality assurance culture for doctoral education.

9.1 There are well-established and publicly available policies and procedures for internal quality assurance of doctoral education.

University does not have a designed policy and procedure for quality assurance of PhD education yet.

9.2 The internal and external stakeholders of doctoral education are involved in the quality assurance

processes.
<p>9.3 HEI collects reliable information on the implemented processes through feedback mechanisms, which is evaluated for the improvement of the goals and processes of doctoral education.</p> <p>a. Research Center and Quality Assurance Center have designed a survey for University's research activities and PhD education program (See doc. 11 Survey).</p> <p>b. Two types of surveys are planned to be carried out;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • For the research field of University, where PhD program will be included. • For evaluating/assessing efficiency of courses at the end of each semester after the new program is invested.
<p>9.4 The internal quality assurance system of doctoral education is periodically reviewed.</p> <p>Not yet applicable</p>

SWOT analysis of the doctoral program

	External Opportunities	External Threats
	<p>(O)</p> <p>List 4-5 External Opportunities</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The new program is consistent with European principles and standards, which gives an opportunity to establish cooperation with international universities within the scope of 3rd level of higher education. 2. Use the opportunity provided by international grant programs in terms of supervisors' trainings and design of Supervisor's guideline. 3. Use the opportunities of Erasmus+ in order to activate 	<p>(T)</p> <p>List 4-5 External Threats</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Ministry of Education and Science of RA may not accept the Second part of PhD program dedicated to the research in arts as it requires changes in system. 2. The right for research supervision is granted not by the university, but by Supreme Certifying Commission of RA. 3. The requirements for supervision presented by Supreme Certifying Commission of RA are not relevant and they hinder not only the policy for human resource management, but also can have a negative impact on the motivation for becoming a supervisor.

	<p>mobility of doctoral candidates and professors.</p> <p>4. Establish relationships with other universities for cooperation.</p>	
<p>Internal Strengths</p> <p>(S)</p> <p>List 4-5 Internal strengths</p> <p>1. The program is flexible, targeted, the scope of topics is defined based on goals of research strategy and research directions.</p> <p>2. The program for the first time in Armenia suggests doctoral education for research in arts.</p> <p>3. A new procedure for admission has been designed by the new program, which instead of general professional examination, suggests a concept- proposal from applicants, written publication(s) and an interview.</p> <p>4. A clearly defined,</p>	<p>S-O</p> <p>“Max-Max” Strategy</p> <p>Strategies that use strengths to maximise opportunities</p> <p>It is planned to suggest other universities to prepare a joint program proposal and to present to international grant organisations in terms of supervisors’ trainings and development of Sepervisor’s guideline.</p>	<p>S-T</p> <p>“Max-Min” Strategy</p> <p>Strategies that use strengths to minimise threats</p> <p>Dissemination policy and advertising are done in order to accept and verify the new PhD program for research in arts.</p>

<p>regulated and monitored mechanism has been set for supervisor’s work, cooperation between supervisor and PhD student, as well as rights and responsibilities of University and PhD student.</p> <p>5. Research Center has been established at University, which will coordinate and control the process of PhD program implementation and will satisfy the requirements of research works.</p>		
<p>Internal Weaknesses</p> <p>(W)</p> <p>List 4-5 Internal Weaknesses</p> <p>1</p> <p>2</p> <p>3</p> <p>4</p>	<p>W-O</p> <p>“Min-Max” Strategy</p> <p>Strategies that minimize weaknesses by taking advantage of opportunities</p>	<p>W-T</p> <p>“Min-Min” Strategy</p> <p>Strategies that minimize weaknesses and avoid threats</p>